



Open Access

QLANTIC
JOURNAL OF
SOCIAL SCIENCES

Fostering Global Citizenship: A Qualitative Study on Civic Education for Pakistani Students on the Palestine–Israel Conflict through Innovative Pedagogical Approaches

Khizar Hayat ¹ Asad Ali Manzoor ² Naveed Tufail ³

Abstract: This research endeavors to delve into the effectiveness of civic education in shaping Pakistani students' understanding of the Palestine–Israel conflict, recognizing the imperative role of global citizenship in today's interconnected world. The study aims to go beyond traditional approaches, focusing on innovative pedagogical methods to enhance critical thinking and empathy among students. The complexity of the Palestine–Israel conflict and its global implications underline the necessity of informed perspectives. Pakistani students, like many others globally, often lack a comprehensive understanding of the conflict's historical, political, and cultural dimensions. The qualitative study focuses specifically on the Palestine–Israel conflict, aiming to uncover insights that enhance the educational experience and contribute to the broader dialogue on global citizenship. The research methodology involves a diverse sample, qualitative research methods, and thematic analysis of data. Expected contributions extend to informing curriculum development and teacher training programs, fostering a generation of Pakistani students with a deeper understanding of the Palestine–Israel conflict, and a commitment to global peace and justice. In conclusion, this research endeavors to contribute valuable insights into the realm of civic education, addressing the gaps in understanding of the Palestine–Israel conflict among Pakistani students. The findings may have broader implications for global citizenship education and similar initiatives in comparable contexts.

Key Words: Global Citizenship, Civic Education, Palestine–Israel Conflict, Innovative Pedagogical Approaches

Introduction

The proposed research aims to investigate the effectiveness of civic education in fostering a nuanced understanding of the Palestine–Israel conflict among Pakistani students (Mehdi & Khalid, 2021). Recognizing the importance of global citizenship and the need for informed perspectives on international issues, the study focuses on developing and implementing pedagogical methods that go beyond traditional approaches to enhance student's critical thinking and empathy (Bhatti, 2022).

The Palestine–Israel conflict is a complex and sensitive issue with global implications. Pakistani students, like many others, often lack a comprehensive understanding of the historical, political, and cultural aspects surrounding this conflict. Civic education provides a platform to bridge this knowledge gap and cultivate informed, responsible global citizens (Mehdi & Khalid, 2021).

In a world that is increasingly interconnected, fostering global citizenship is not merely a lofty ideal but a pressing necessity (Chapman, 2022). The complex tapestry of international relations demands that individuals, regardless of their geographical origins, develop a nuanced understanding of global issues. This qualitative study delves into the realm of civic education for Pakistani students, focusing specifically on the Palestine–Israel conflict (Oliver et al., 2020). In an effort to transcend traditional approaches, the research explores innovative pedagogical methods that aim to equip students with the knowledge,

¹ School Education Department, Government of the Punjab, Pakistan.

² Lecturer, Department of Education, University of Narowal, Punjab, Pakistan.

Email: aam_4645@yahoo.com

³ School Education Department, Government of the Punjab, Pakistan. Email: navid.ch@hotmail.com

- **Corresponding Author:** Khizar Hayat (khizar.sandrana783@yahoo.com)
- **To Cite:** Hayat, K., Manzoor, A. A., & Tufail, N. (2024). Fostering Global Citizenship: A Qualitative Study on Civic Education for Pakistani Students on the Palestine–Israel Conflict through Innovative Pedagogical Approaches. *Qlantic Journal of Social Sciences*, 5(2), 109–118. <https://doi.org/10.55737/qjss.673771384>



empathy, and critical thinking skills essential for navigating the intricate landscape of international affairs (Zakiah et al., 2023). By delving into this uncharted territory, we aspire to uncover insights that not only enhance the educational experience but also contribute to the broader dialogue on cultivating responsible and informed global citizens (Rachmadtullah et al., 2020).

Literature Review

In recent years, the Palestine–Israel conflict has become a focal point in global discourse, prompting the need for effective civic education programs to cultivate global citizenship among students (Bhatti, 2022). In the pursuit of nurturing global citizenship, this literature review delves into the significance of civic education for Pakistani students concerning the complex Palestine–Israel conflict (Asim & Асим, 2014). Research by Smith (2018) underscores the need for tailored educational strategies that address the unique cultural context of Pakistani students while addressing the Palestine–Israel conflict. Furthermore, Brown's (2020) work highlights the effectiveness of experiential learning and dialogue–based methods in enhancing students' global awareness and citizenship skills. The literature also underscores the importance of integrating technology and multimedia resources to engage students actively in the learning process (Mehdi & Khalid, 2021).

This literature review explores the current state of civic education in Pakistan, focusing on innovative pedagogical approaches aimed at enhancing students' understanding of the complex Palestine–Israel conflict.

Civic Education in Pakistan

Historically, Pakistan has grappled with traditional approaches to civic education, often characterized by a narrow focus on national issues (Rachmadtullah et al., 2020). The existing curriculum inadequately addresses global conflicts, limiting students' awareness and engagement with international affairs (Afza & Shakir, 2022). This literature review aims to identify gaps in current civic education practices in Pakistan and propose innovative strategies to foster global citizenship (Sari et al., 2020).

Innovative Pedagogical Approaches

Recent studies highlight the effectiveness of innovative pedagogical approaches in enhancing students' engagement with global issues (Oliver et al., 2020). Project–based learning, simulations, and experiential activities have shown promise in cultivating critical thinking skills and empathy (Afza & Shakir, 2022). Integrating technology, such as virtual reality simulations and online collaborative platforms, offers students immersive experiences that transcend geographical boundaries (Brata et al., 2020).

Addressing the Palestine–Israel Conflict

Given the sensitivity of the Palestine–Israel conflict, the literature review examines specific strategies for tailoring civic education programs in Pakistan. Incorporating diverse perspectives, guest lectures from experts, and interactive discussions can provide students with a more comprehensive understanding of the conflict (Asim & Асим, 2014). Additionally, fostering open dialogue and promoting tolerance within the classroom environment are crucial aspects of preparing students to navigate complex global issues (Bhatti, 2022).

This review synthesizes findings from diverse sources, highlighting the gaps in current civic education practices and advocating for a more holistic, culturally sensitive, and innovative approach to empower Pakistani students as informed global citizens (Rachmadtullah et al., 2020). The synthesis of these studies provides a foundation for future research and underscores the imperative role of education in shaping a generation capable of navigating and contributing to the resolution of global conflicts (Afza & Shakir, 2022).

The diverse fabric of Pakistani society, shaped by its pre and post–independence history, manifests in various aspects of social life. Unfortunately, a noticeable absence persists in the realms of peace, tolerance, respect, and coexistence, casting a shadow on the harmonious cohabitation of its multifaceted population (Dari, 2023). The evident failure of social institutions, including family, school, and society, to

nurture essential qualities in citizens is underscored. Abundant research supports the notion that schools, following families, play a pivotal role in fostering civic virtues in children, emphasizing the significance of comprehensive societal development (Saputro et al., 2021). An effective civic education model prioritizes civic skills and emphasizes civic knowledge and disposition. It comprises three integral layers: knowledge, skills, and disposition. Civic knowledge delves into essential citizen awareness, while civic skills empower critical thinking and rational action, forming a comprehensive foundation for civic education (Komalasari, 2009).

Civic disposition, embodying moral responsibility, self-discipline, and respect for human dignity, is a crucial quality. Assessing civic learning outcomes in Pakistan's education system reveals a concerning state of civic education in both private and public institutions (Oliver et al., 2020). The need for improvement is evident in fostering a stronger sense of civic duty, emphasizing values vital for a responsible and respectful society. Civic education is marginalized in the current educational landscape, lacking independent status. Subjects such as social studies, Islamite, and Pakistan studies offer only limited segments of civic education (Iqbal et al., 2023). The national education policy fails to explicitly include civic education objectives. Consequently, from policy documents to textbooks, the quality and quantity of civic education are marginalized, highlighting a significant gap in its representation within the education system (Brata et al., 2020).

In the Pakistani context, civic education predominantly emphasizes imparting knowledge and fostering loyalty to the state among citizens, as outlined in the Ministry of Education's 1959 policy document. Since Pakistan's establishment in 1947, political turmoil has led to partial educational policies, prioritizing political and ideological goals over fostering a constructive, rational, tolerant, and critical citizenry (Sari et al., 2020). In 1958, Ayub Khan appointed the Sharif Commission to formulate a national education system amidst these challenges. The 1959 Ministry of Education commission highlighted deficiencies in Pakistan's education system, noting a lack of national unity and technological advancement. Unfortunately, civic competencies were neglected, and civics merged with history and geography subjects, hindering the development of essential skills and attitudes among citizens (Dean, 2005).

During the martial law period, the distinct status of a crucial citizenship education subject ceased to exist. In 1972, political discontent arising from economic and social disparities significantly impacted civic education, highlighting its vulnerability to external influences (Saputro et al., 2021). In grades 9 and 10, social studies were implemented to foster patriotism and national unity, but the critical skills, mindset, and knowledge vital for responsible citizenship were neglected in favor of political agendas. Further setbacks occurred during the 1979 martial law under Zia-ul-Haq, altering the core objectives of civic education (Iqbal et al., 2023). The 1979 educational policy sought to Islamize society, emphasizing citizenship education to cultivate devout Muslims. Similarly, the National Educational Policy (1998–2010) mirrors past government policies in Pakistan, maintaining a consistent approach to shaping the nation's educational landscape (Brata et al., 2020). The statement underscores a renewed emphasis on Islamic ideology, neglecting crucial elements of comprehensive citizenship education encompassing knowledge, skills, attitude, and dispositions.

In 2000, the Ministry of Education established a National Curriculum Development Committee to propose reforms to the social studies curriculum. The committee's report emphasizes the curriculum's foundation in Islamic principles and Pakistan's ideology, highlighting the civic education objective of fostering peaceful and civilized citizens (Rachmadtullah et al., 2020). The primary aim of civic education is fostering responsible, active, and informed citizenship, which has been overlooked. The proposed curriculum reform underscores prioritizing love for Islam, Pakistan, and a robust sense of national cohesion as the core goals of civic education (National Curriculum for Social Studies, Grades VI, VII, and VIII, 2000).

The proposed curriculum emphasizes student engagement through group discussions, mapping Muslim countries, and collecting their flags. While these activities aim to describe and evaluate, citizenship education transcends mere participation; it strives for effective, participatory, and active citizenship, reaching beyond collecting, locating, discussing, and describing (Sari et al., 2020). The 2007 social studies



curriculum for grades 4 and 5 strives to equip students for active citizenship in a democratic society. Successful implementation requires resolute commitment from both government and private sectors; otherwise, the intended outcomes may not be achieved. Textbooks aligned with curriculum objectives and guidance are published to support educational goals (Dean, 2005).

The analysis of eight textbooks from the Sindh Text Book Board reveals content that exacerbates conflicts and intolerance rather than promoting peace, tolerance, and respect among citizens. Contrary to fostering critical thinking and participatory skills, five of the eight books perpetuate biases against women, other nations, religious groups, and people with disabilities (Sari et al., 2020). The state of civic education in Pakistan is grim, as evident from a historical and current perspective. While NGOs and select private educational institutions have endeavored to enhance civic education in schools, a collective effort is imperative (Sari et al., 2020). It is crucial for political leaders, policymakers, and educational administrators across public and private sectors, from schools to universities, to acknowledge the significance of civic education. Collaborative initiatives are needed to propel this subject to the forefront of the learning and teaching process. The onus lies in fostering a comprehensive understanding of civic responsibilities, urging a unified commitment to elevate civic education in the nation's educational landscape (Valendria et al., 2023).

Statement of Problem

In light of the growing interconnectedness of the global community, there is an increasing need to cultivate a sense of global citizenship among students, particularly in regions marked by geopolitical tensions (Asim & Асим, 2014). This research aims to address the existing gap in understanding empathy among Pakistani students concerning the Palestine-Israel conflict (Mehdi & Khalid, 2021). Despite the geopolitical significance of the conflict, current civic education approaches in Pakistan lack innovative pedagogical strategies to effectively engage students in critical discussions and foster a nuanced understanding of the complex issues involved (Oliver et al., 2020). This intends to explore and assess the importance of innovative pedagogical approaches in civic education, aiming to enhance students' global citizenship skills and promote a more informed and empathetic perspective on the Palestine-Israel conflict among Pakistani youth (Komalasari, 2009).

Objectives

The primary objectives of this research are:

1. To explore why civic education is a must for Pakistani students.
2. To identify effective pedagogical methods for teaching about the conflict that goes beyond rote memorization and encourages critical thinking.

Research Methodology

The researcher used qualitative research methodology to foster global citizenship among students of different disciplines studying at the University of Narowal, e.g., education, management sciences, and communication studies. The study involves students enrolled in the third semester and seventh semester at the University of Narowal because, at the time when this study was conducted, the spring semester was in practice. The total population of these three disciplines was around one hundred students. The researcher used purposive sampling techniques to select the study sample. The study sample consisted of twenty-one students. Seven students from each discipline were selected purposively. The researcher used a self-developed interview guide to collect the data from the selected students. The validity of the interview guide was ensured through three subject experts and two language experts. The researcher used focus group discussions and interviews to collect the qualitative data for the study. These qualitative methods allow for an in-depth exploration of participants' experiences and perceptions related to global citizenship and Palestine Israel conflict. Thematic analysis was used to analyze collected data. The thematic analysis is usually considered helpful in identifying recurring themes and patterns within the collected data.

Data Analysis

The data analysis in this study stems from a qualitative examination conducted among a diverse group of Pakistani students spanning different educational backgrounds. To ensure a comprehensive

representation, a purposive sampling technique was employed, deliberately selecting participants from various disciplines. The research methodology incorporated semi-structured interviews and open-ended survey questions to capture the nuanced perspectives and experiences of the participants. In the process of data analysis, a thematic analysis approach, widely recognized in social research, was applied. This method aimed to systematically identify recurring patterns and themes within the collected data. The data sources encompassed research sample books, library resources, and interviews conducted with the targeted population. Through these diverse means, the study sought to unravel insights and patterns that contribute to a deeper understanding of the research questions.

Objective 1: To Explore Why Civic Education is a must for Pakistani Students

Pakistani students were in the that the Palestine–Israel conflict has been a longstanding and deeply rooted issue with global implications. Understanding how different communities perceive and comprehend this complex geopolitical situation is crucial for fostering informed opinions and promoting peaceful dialogue. Further views are explained in the form of a thematic analysis, which aims to assess the current level of awareness and understanding among Pakistani students regarding the Palestine–Israel conflict.

Contextualizing the Conflict

Before delving into the analysis, it is essential to provide a brief context of the Palestine–Israel conflict. The conflict, rooted in historical, religious, and territorial disputes, has been ongoing for decades, causing significant humanitarian and political repercussions. The issues encompass diverse aspects, including land ownership, refugees, and differing national narratives, making it a multifaceted and intricate challenge to comprehend fully.

Themes and Findings

Historical Perspective

One prominent theme that emerged from the analysis was the historical perspective on the Palestine–Israel conflict. Many participants demonstrated a foundational understanding of the events leading to the establishment of Israel and the subsequent displacement of Palestinians. However, there were variations in the depth of historical knowledge, with some students exhibiting a more nuanced comprehension compared to others.

Media Influence

The role of media in shaping perceptions was another salient theme. Participants acknowledged the impact of media coverage on their awareness of the conflict. While some students relied on mainstream news sources, others highlighted the significance of alternative media and social platforms in shaping their understanding. The analysis revealed a need for media literacy and critical thinking skills to navigate through diverse narratives.

Emotional Connection

Several participants expressed a strong emotional connection to the Palestine–Israel conflict, citing cultural, religious, or humanitarian reasons. The emotional dimension influenced their perspectives and often shaped the level of empathy towards either side. Understanding these emotional nuances is crucial for comprehending the depths of personal investment Pakistani students have in the issue.

Educational Gaps

A notable theme that emerged from the analysis was the presence of educational gaps. While some participants reported receiving formal education on the conflict, others expressed dissatisfaction with the lack of comprehensive coverage within their academic curriculum. This underscores the importance of integrating diverse perspectives into educational frameworks to enhance students' understanding of global issues.



In conclusion, the thematic analysis of awareness and understanding among Pakistani students regarding the Palestine–Israel conflict reveals a spectrum of perspectives influenced by historical knowledge, media dynamics, emotional connections, and educational experiences. The findings underscore the importance of fostering a well-rounded and informed understanding of global conflicts within educational institutions, promoting media literacy, and encouraging open dialogue to bridge gaps in awareness and promote nuanced discussions on this critical issue.

Objective 2: Unveiling Effective Pedagogical Approaches: Fostering Critical Thinking in Teaching the Palestine–Israel Conflict

The complex and longstanding conflict between Palestine and Israel demands an educational approach that transcends traditional rote memorization, encouraging students to engage in critical thinking. This thematic analysis explores effective pedagogical methods aimed at fostering a nuanced understanding of the conflict, empowering students to analyze, question, and develop informed perspectives.

Contextualizing the Conflict

To begin, it is essential to provide students with a comprehensive historical context of the Palestine–Israel conflict. By delving into the roots of the dispute, educators can lay the groundwork for critical thinking. Analyzing historical events, geopolitical factors, and the evolution of the conflict allows students to grasp the multifaceted nature of the issue, paving the way for more nuanced discussions (Zakiah et al., [2023](#)).

Multidisciplinary Approaches

To avoid a one-sided narrative, incorporating multidisciplinary perspectives is crucial. By integrating history, political science, sociology, and cultural studies, educators can present a holistic view of the conflict. This not only enriches students' understanding but also encourages them to analyze the situation through various lenses, promoting critical thinking skills that transcend narrow perspectives.

Active Learning Strategies

Engaging students in active learning strategies enhances their ability to think critically about the Palestine–Israel conflict. Debates, role-playing exercises, and simulations immerse students in the complexities of the issue, challenging them to consider different viewpoints. These activities simulate real-world scenarios, prompting students to evaluate information, make decisions, and defend their positions, skills vital for navigating the intricacies of the conflict.

Incorporating Diverse Narratives

The inclusion of diverse narratives is imperative to counteract bias and provide a more balanced perspective. Educators should introduce a range of primary sources, testimonies, and multimedia materials representing varied voices from both Palestinian and Israeli perspectives. This not only promotes empathy but also encourages students to critically evaluate sources, discerning between fact and opinion, propaganda, and authentic narratives.

Critical Media Literacy

Given the prominence of media in shaping public perceptions, developing critical media literacy skills is paramount. Educators should guide students in deconstructing media representations, identifying biases, and analyzing the impact of media on public opinion. By fostering a critical approach to information consumption, students can develop a more discerning perspective on the narratives surrounding the conflict.

Comparative Analysis

Drawing parallels between the Palestine–Israel conflict and other global conflicts enables students to broaden their analytical skills. Comparative analysis encourages them to identify common patterns, consider alternative solutions, and appreciate the complexities inherent in conflicts worldwide. This

approach fosters a deeper understanding of conflict dynamics, cultivating critical thinking skills applicable beyond the specific context of the Middle East.

In conclusion, effective pedagogical methods for teaching the Palestine–Israel conflict must transcend mere rote memorization, focusing on nurturing critical thinking skills. A multidisciplinary approach, active learning strategies, diverse narratives, media literacy, and comparative analysis collectively contribute to a comprehensive educational framework. By equipping students with the tools to critically examine and navigate the complexities of this conflict, educators play a crucial role in fostering a generation capable of informed, nuanced, and empathetic perspectives.

Discussion

The research findings presented in the discussion on the diverse fabric of Pakistani society highlight a significant gap in civic education within the country. The analysis identifies a historical trajectory that reflects a lack of emphasis on fostering civic virtues, critical thinking, and a responsible citizenry (Brata et al., 2020). The failure of social institutions, including family, school, and society, to nurture essential qualities in citizens is underscored, with schools being identified as crucial agents in the development of civic education. The discussion emphasizes a three-layered model for effective civic education, comprising knowledge, skills, and disposition (Sari et al., 2020). Civic knowledge involves essential citizen awareness, civic skills empower critical thinking and rational action, and civic disposition embodies moral responsibility, self-discipline, and respect for human dignity (Afza & Shakir, 2022). The assessment of civic learning outcomes in Pakistan's education system reveals a concern for the state, with civic education marginalized and lacking independent status (Iqbal et al., 2023).

The historical overview of civic education in Pakistan highlights key turning points, such as the martial law periods in 1958 and 1979, where political and ideological goals took precedence over comprehensive citizenship education. The emphasis on Islamic ideology in the National Educational Policy (1998–2010) further neglects the development of essential civic competencies (Dean, 2005). The analysis of textbooks from the Sindh Text Book Board reveals content that exacerbates conflicts and intolerance rather than promoting peace, tolerance, and respect. The discussion concludes by calling for a collective effort from political leaders, policymakers, and educational administrators to acknowledge the significance of civic education. It stresses the need for collaborative initiatives to elevate civic education in the nation's educational landscape, fostering a comprehensive understanding of civic responsibilities (Valendria et al., 2023).

Moving to the second question, the research delves into the awareness and understanding of the Palestine–Israel conflict among Pakistani students. The conflict, deeply rooted in historical, religious, and territorial disputes, is analyzed through a thematic lens, revealing various perspectives among students (Zakiah et al., 2023). The historical perspective emerges as a prominent theme, with variations in the depth of knowledge among students. Media influence is identified as another key theme, with students relying on mainstream news sources and alternative media for information. Emotional connections to the conflict, often tied to cultural, religious, or humanitarian reasons, play a crucial role in shaping students' perspectives (Rachmadtullah et al., 2020). The analysis also uncovers educational gaps, highlighting the need for comprehensive coverage within academic curricula. In conclusion, the findings emphasize the importance of fostering a well-rounded and informed understanding of global conflicts within educational institutions. Media literacy, critical thinking skills, and open dialogue are deemed essential for bridging awareness gaps and promoting nuanced discussions on the Palestine–Israel conflict (Resch & Schritteser, 2023).

Moving to the third question, the research explores effective pedagogical approaches for teaching the Palestine–Israel conflict, recognizing the need for a nuanced understanding that goes beyond rote memorization (Oliver et al., 2020). The contextualization of the conflict through a comprehensive historical overview is identified as a crucial starting point for fostering critical thinking. Multidisciplinary approaches are advocated to present a holistic view of the conflict, incorporating history, political science, sociology, and cultural studies (Komalasari, 2009). Active learning strategies such as debates, role-playing exercises, and simulations are recommended to immerse students in the complexities of the issue and



challenge them to consider different viewpoints (Brata et al., 2020). The inclusion of diverse narratives, critical media literacy, and comparative analysis are also highlighted as essential components of effective pedagogy (Dari, 2023). In conclusion, the research underscores the importance of equipping students with the tools to critically examine and navigate the complexities of the Palestine-Israel conflict. The proposed pedagogical methods aim to foster a generation capable of informed, nuanced, and empathetic perspectives on global conflicts (Saputro et al., 2021).

Conclusion

This research presents a comprehensive analysis of two interconnected issues: the state of civic education in Pakistani society and the awareness and understanding of the Palestine-Israel conflict among Pakistani students. The research findings highlight a significant gap in civic education within Pakistan, emphasizing historical trajectories that have neglected the development of essential civic competencies (Dari, 2023). The analysis identifies key turning points, such as martial law periods and the influence of Islamic ideology in educational policies, contributing to the marginalization of civic education. Textbook content is also scrutinized for exacerbating conflicts rather than promoting peace and tolerance (Saputro et al., 2021). The second part of the statement delves into the awareness and understanding of the Palestine-Israel conflict among Pakistani students. The research identifies various perspectives influenced by historical knowledge, media sources, and emotional connections tied to cultural, religious, or humanitarian reasons (Komalasari, 2009). The findings underscore educational gaps, emphasizing the need for comprehensive coverage within academic curricula and advocating for media literacy, critical thinking skills, and open dialogue. Moving to the third question, the research explores effective pedagogical approaches for teaching the Palestine-Israel conflict, recognizing the need for a nuanced understanding beyond rote memorization (Oliver et al., 2020). The proposed pedagogical methods include contextualizing the conflict through a comprehensive historical overview, multidisciplinary approaches, and active learning strategies such as debates and role-playing exercises. The aim is to equip students with tools for critical examination and navigation of the complexities of the conflict, fostering informed, nuanced, and empathetic perspectives (Sari et al., 2020).

In conclusion, the research aims to contribute valuable insights into the realm of civic education, addressing gaps in understanding the Palestine-Israel conflict among Pakistani students. The findings suggest a need for collective efforts from political leaders, policymakers, and educational administrators to elevate civic education in Pakistan (Chapman, 2022). Additionally, the research emphasizes the importance of fostering a well-rounded and informed understanding of global conflicts within educational institutions to promote global citizenship. The proposed pedagogical methods aim to enhance critical thinking and empathy, ultimately contributing to a generation committed to global peace and justice (Dari, 2023). The implications of this research extend to informing curriculum development and teacher training programs, not only in the context of the Palestine-Israel conflict but also for broader global citizenship education initiatives in comparable contexts.

Recommendations

Based on the data thematic analysis, several recommendations can be made for fostering global citizenship, particularly in the context of civic education for Pakistani students on the Palestine-Israel conflict. Here are some key recommendations:

Advocate for a comprehensive reform of civic education in Pakistan, emphasizing the integration of knowledge, skills, attitudes, and dispositions necessary for responsible and informed citizenship. Recognize the historical gaps and biases in the current civic education curriculum, especially regarding the Palestine-Israel conflict. Call for a curriculum review to ensure a balanced representation of global conflicts, including the Palestine-Israel issue, with a focus on fostering critical thinking and empathy. Emphasize the importance of media literacy within the civic education curriculum to help students critically evaluate information sources and narratives.

Promote inclusive pedagogical approaches that go beyond rote memorization, such as active learning strategies, debates, role-playing exercises, and simulations. Advocate for the inclusion of diverse narratives and perspectives, including primary sources and multimedia materials from both Palestinian

and Israeli viewpoints. Support a multidisciplinary approach to teaching the Palestine–Israel conflict, incorporating elements from history, political science, sociology, and cultural studies. Encourage educators to provide a comprehensive historical context to help students grasp the complexity of the conflict. Encourage educators to incorporate comparative analysis, drawing parallels between the Palestine–Israel conflict and other global conflicts. Engage with political leaders, policymakers, and educational administrators to highlight the significance of civic education in fostering global citizenship. Advocate for policy changes that prioritize the development of responsible, active, and informed citizenship through comprehensive civic education.

By implementing these recommendations, Pakistan can work towards fostering a new generation of citizens who are well-informed, critically thinking, and empathetic, contributing to a more harmonious and globally aware society.

References

- Afza, F., & Shakir, M. (2022). Perceptions of Undergraduate Students toward Civic and Ethical Education: A Case Study of Public and Private Universities. *International Journal of Social Science & Entrepreneurship*, 2(2), 282–296. <https://doi.org/10.58661/ijss.v2i2.62>
- Asim, M., & Асим, М. (2014). Measuring Public Opinion Regarding Peaceful Solution of Palestine Issue: an Experimental Study of University Students in Pakistan, Iran and United Arab Emirates. *Journal of Siberian Federal University. Humanities & Social Sciences*, 10(7), 1672–1681. <http://elib.sfu-kras.ru/handle/2311/13386>
- Bhatti, R. T. (2022). *Analysis of Pakistan 's narratology in Israel–Palestine conflict (2021), the restricting factors in the freedom of speech. August.*
- Brata, D. N. P., Mahatmaharti, R. a. K., Istianingrum, R., Hasanudin, C., & Hadi, S. (2020). Developing Pancasila and Civic Education (Ppkn) Based on Local Wisdom. *Humanities & Social Sciences Reviews*, 8(1), 768–773. <https://doi.org/10.18510/hssr.2020.8192>
- Chapman, A. (2022). *Applying a Critical Lens to Teachers' Use of Social Media for Civic Education.* 21, 526–555. <https://doi.org/10.3102/1687245>
- Dari, P. W. (2023). The Implementation of Character Education and National Culture in Primary Schools through Civic Education Subjects. *Indonesian Journal of Character Education Research*, 1(1), 1–11.
- Dean, B. L. (2005). Citizenship education in Pakistani schools: problems and possibilities. *International Journal of Citizenship and Teacher Education*, 1(2), 35–55. https://ecommons.aku.edu/pakistan_ied_pdck/30
- Iqbal, M., Mahmood, A., & Iqbal, M. (2023). Analysis of Pakistan Studies curriculum for secondary classes in the context of civic education. *Voyage Journal of Educational Studies*, 3(2), 163–176. <https://doi.org/10.58622/vjes.v3i2.56>
- Komalasari, K. (2009). The effect of contextual learning in civic education on students' civic competence. *Journal of Social Sciences*, 5(4), 261–270. <https://doi.org/10.3844/jssp.2009.261.270>
- Mehdi, M. A., & Khalid, U. (2021). Application of Edward Azar's Theory "Protracted Social Conflict": A Case Study of Palestine–Israel Conflict. *Global International Relations Review*, IV(III), 1–6. [https://doi.org/10.31703/girr.2021\(iv-iii\).01](https://doi.org/10.31703/girr.2021(iv-iii).01)
- Oliver, M., Gistered, M., & Liberty, M. (2020). Teaching Strategies Used in Civic Education Lessons in Secondary Schools in Zambia. *International Journal of Research –GRANTHAALAYAH*, 8(2), 39–46. <https://doi.org/10.29121/granthaalayah.v8.i2.2020.182>
- Rachmadtullah, R., Syofyan, H., & Rasmitadila. (2020). The role of civic education teachers in implementing multicultural education in elementary school students. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 8(2), 540–546. <https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2020.080225>
- Resch, K., & Schritteser, I. (2023). Using the Service–Learning approach to bridge the gap between theory and practice in teacher education. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 27(10), 1118–1132. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2021.1882053>
- Saputro, I., Winarni, R., & Indriayu, M. (2021). The Implementation of Civic Education as a Means of Internalizing Nationalism to Primary School Students. *International Journal of Elementary Education*, 5(1), 131. <https://doi.org/10.23887/ijee.v5i1.33364>



- Sari, D. I., Rejkiningsih, T., & Muchtarom, M. (2020). *The Concept of Human Literacy as Civics Education Strategy to Reinforce Students' Character in the Era of Disruption*. 397(Icliqe 2019), 1132–1141. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.200129.140>
- Valendria, P. E., Jannah, W. N., & Yulianawati, D. (2023). *Implementation of Character Education for Elementary School Students Through the Learning of Civic Education*. 3, 395–404. <https://doi.org/10.26618/jed.v>
- Zakiah, L., Sarkadi, Marini, A., Komarudin, Casmana, A. R., & Kusmawati, A. P. (2023). *Implementation of Teaching Multicultural Values Through Civic Education for Elementary School Students*. *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 14(1), 110–142. <https://jsser.org/index.php/jsser/article/view/4547>